

# EDGAR EVENTS Researching and sharing Edgar family history No. 49, February 2011



# **DNA Update**



by James Edgar (jamesedgar@sasktel.net)

New members and contacts... Wow, we've had a flurry of activity since we last reported on our DNA happenings.

On New Year's Day, I trolled around Facebook, adding numerous Edgars as friends and relatives (or both). Plus, I phoned numerous Edgars in

Saskatchewan. Here are some of the ones I've had contact with, or contacted me back since then (alphabetically):

The recent Facebook additions: Aaron Edgar (Amsterdam, New York); Alexis Elizabeth Edgar (Amsterdam, New York); Chantelle Maryanne Edgar (Toronto, Ontario); Charlotte Edgar (Houston Texas); Chaundra Edgar (NY?); Chris Edgar (Bury St. Edmonds, UK); Darrin Edgar Jr. (Amsterdam, New York); Dylan Edgar (Amsterdam, New York); Elaine Edgar (London, UK); Ericha Edgar Martinous (Huntsville, AR); Eva Edgar McKenna (Prince Rupert, B.C.); George Edgar (Amsterdam, New York); James Edgar (Oakville, ON); Jim Edgar (Keele, UK); Johanna Edgar Dittrich (Huntsville, AR); John Edgar (Canajoharie, NY); Juliet Edgar (Liverpool, UK); Kaitlin Edgar (Ft. Plain, NY); Keith Edgar (Troy, MI); Keith Edgar (NI); Lucille Edgar (near Chicago, IL); Mandy Edgar (London, UK); Meg Edgar (Hartford, CT); Missy Johnson-Edgar (Coatsville, IN); Nancy Edgar (Huntsville, AR); Peter Edgar (Issaquah, Washington); Roberta Titus Edgar (Philadelphia, PA); Robert Allan Lee Edgar (Prince Rupert, B.C. - joined our Ancestry.com group); Robert Edgar (Amsterdam, New York); Sam Edgar (Birmingham, UK); Sandy Edgar Beaudoin (NY?); Shane Edgar (NY); Sherry Edgar Olson (CA); Stephen Edgar (Belfast, NI); Stephen Edgar (Coventry, UK); Stephen Edgar (Amsterdam, New York); Stephen Raymond Edgar Jr (NY?); Steve Edgar (Missoula, MT); Steve Edgar (Manchester, UK); Steve Edgar (IA?); Steve Edgar (Medway, UK); Steve Edgar (Wheeling, WV); Steven Edgar (India); Steven Edgar (Jourdanton, TX); Steven Edgar (Dover, PA); Steven Edgar (Luton, UK); Steven Edgar (Bromley, UK); Steven Edgar (Kilkeel, NI); Steven Edgar (Falkirk, Scotland); Steven Edgar (Luton, UK); Steven Edgar (Pleasanton, TX); Steven Edgar (Newcastle Upon Tyne, UK); Steven Edgar (Bristol, UK); Steven Edgar (Doune, Scotland); Steven Edgar Sr (Cheshire, UK); Sunshine Edgar (Amsterdam, NY); Susan Parkes Edgar (Gloucester, UK); Taylor Dittrich (Huntsville, AR); Tina Edgar (Amsterdam, New York); Betty Wilkins (Birmingham, UK)

**Jim Edgar** of Glendale Heights, IL, USA, has been a member of our group from almost the very beginning, and he tells us he is ready to have his DNA tested. The kit is ordered – great news, Jim!

**Frank Edgar** of Jamieson, PA, USA, had previously been tested at Ancestry.com, but had never joined our site. **Frank**'s daughter-in-law, **Roberta Titus Edgar** (see above), sponsored his test in response to a mailout that **SteveUK** had done some months ago. **Frank** is in Haplogroup I1, one of the few test results to connect to my own DNA. **Frank** is much closer to **SteveTO**, though, being only 23 generations away (give or take a few).

Susan Howe wrote us on January 12 that she was descended from George and Elizabeth Edgar. George's will places him in Bedford Co., VA, USA, in 1765. Susan mentioned Phoebe Wright as another ancestor. A search of our data showed Phoebe to also be an ancestor of the recently deceased G.C. Edgar (R1b) of Texas. Bingo! Susan and G.C. were

cousins. Another of **G.C.**'s cousins contacted me later on – **Sherrie Kinard**, whose mum is an **Edgar**.

Adrian Edgar of Adelaide, SA, Australia, was introduced to us from Peter Edgar. Adrian has just joined our group at Ancestry.com. He, Peter, and Robin (née Hall) Hagedorn are 3rd cousins.

**William Edgar** of Edinburgh has his test results (finally!). He was one of the people I contacted in June of 2009, and now we've got him sorted – he's an Rib, only a few generations away from **Bill (the Pilot)** in Dundee, **Harry** in Edinburgh, **Colin** in Belfast, and **Jim** in Glasgow!

David Edgar of Forfar, Scotland, has sent his swabs in for testing. Thank you, David!

**William Edgar** of Glasgow has had his kit for nearly two years, but hasn't returned the swabs. We're hoping we can convince him to get them into the lab for testing....

**Chris Edgar** of Dundee and **Steven Edgar** of Gravois Mills, MO have both sent test kits – they're at the lab – testing has begun.

**Patricia (Edgar) Leishman** of Dundee is one of the people I contacted in June 2009. She responded by sending me a copy of her tree, as researched by her uncle in 1961. She also wrote that she had been born in South Africa, but that her mother died when she and her siblings were young. The father arranged for relatives in Scotland to take the two older girls, and their brother, **Stuart Bain Edgar**, was placed in foster care in Cape Town. Eventually, his foster parents adopted him and his name was changed to **Croxford**. He matured and had his own family – four boys, **Kevin**, **Alan**, **Robert**, and **Raymond Croxford**. **Patricia** says she had suggested one of them should analyze his DNA, but it hadn't happened.

With a little digging (and with help from **Alida Reilly** in South Africa) I found telephone numbers for two of the boys and have spoken to **Raymond**, emailed **Robert**. **Raymond** has agreed to the DNA test, and the kit is on its way right now.

Now this story gets even better! I received a message on the Rootsweb Edgar message board from a **Merrilee Yule Olson**, responding to an earlier one from a different **Merrilee Olson**. The discussion had begun in September 2009 as *Edgars of Berwick in Australia*, that, by Dec 2010, had morphed into *Edgar Family in Canada*. You can follow the thread here <a href="http://boards.rootsweb.com/surnames.edgar/516.1.2.1.2.2/mb.ashx">http://boards.rootsweb.com/surnames.edgar/516.1.2.1.2.2/mb.ashx</a>

As I re-read the messages, the name "Magnus" leaped off the page in the following message from Merrilee Olson.

Hello Melanie and Laurie! Allow me to jump in! My name is Merrilee, my sister Kim and I are descendents of Magnus Edgar who immigrated to Canada via the Hudson Bay Company in the early 1850's. Love the internet! Any info that we might have about the Canadian Arm just ask! Merrilee

In an earlier post, **Merrilee** had written:

Hello All! I too am a descendent of the Edgar Clan from Scotland. My ancestor Magnus Edgar left the Shetland Islands and came across to Canada with the Hudson Bay company in 1851. He was born in 1826 to George Edgar and Barbara Tait. Other siblings were named Margaret, Alexander, John, Jean, and Katharine I would love to exchange any information on the Edgars and am looking desperately to associate Barbara Tait b. 1794 (I believe) to Robert Tait and Isobel Gray. I am located on the west coast of Canada in British Columbia. Have a great day!

I contacted **Merrilee** right away, as I realized that the **Magnus** on her tree was the same **Magnus** in **Patricia**'s ancestry. After a couple of quick emails, I phoned her and we spoke at length, exchanging files by email all the while. Since then, I've sent messages to some others in the same Rootsweb message thread: **Melanie**, **Christine**, and **Laurie**.

While putting the names that **Merrilee** provided into my database on Family Tree Maker, I was prompted at one point with "Is this **Robert Edgar** the spouse of **Margaret Cossar**?" Before I responded "Yes," I checked to see who this **Margaret Cossar** was, and if the dates matched. That was when I discovered the connection to another on our project, **David Leslie Edgar** of Guildford, England – he's part of this same family!!

In addition to all of the above, I phoned several Edgars from the Saskatchewan phone book over the past few weeks, explaining our project and quest. Some were pleased; some were perplexed; others just didn't care! The two who did respond favourably are now receiving this newsletter. **John Edgar** (Saskatoon, SK); **Tod Edgar** (Lashburn, SK – adopted).

### **Picture time**

To remind ourselves that summer is worth waiting for. A couple of years back, a friend noticed this plucky little petunia growing right out of the pavement in his busy driveway. Here's the photograph – preserved for posterity.





Sharon Edgar (<u>onsims@aol.com</u>)

What's new from Ros Davies Dec. 2010 (Sharon extracted the following from the site): "I'm indexing a book about the <u>Hanna</u> families of Kilkeel by R. Keith Hanna up to 1798. It's an excellent read for anyone researching in the Kilkeel area."

	Hanna of the Close- from		R.K. Hanna, Sheffield	
HOTC	Scottish Origins to 1798	R. Keith Hanna	UK	2008

# Edgar & variants - Eager & Agar:

Hans	EDGAR		Kilkeel	a flax farmer; granted a spinning wheel premium in 1796	HOTC p147
James	EDGAR	•	Kilkeel	a freehold farmer in 1785	HOTC p129
James	EDGAR	-	Kilkeel	a member of the Mourne Volunteer Corps 4 Aug 1792	HOTC p127
James	EDGAR	-	Kilkeel	a flax farmer; granted a spinning wheel premium in 1796	HOTC p147
John	EDGAR		Kilkeel	a flax farmer; a freehold farmer in 1785 & granted a spinning wheel premium in 1796	HOTC p129, 147
Thomas	EDGAR	-	Kilkeel	a member of the Mourne Volunteer Corps 4 Aug 1792	HOTC p127
Thomas	EDGAR	-	Kilkeel	a flax farmer; granted a spinning wheel premium in 1796	HOTC p147

Cummings:

				a member of the Mourne Volunteer	
Edward	CUMMIN	<b> </b>	Kilkeel	Corps 4 Aug 1792	HOTC p127
Edward	CUMMIN	-	Kilkeel	a flax grower; granted a spinning wheel premium in 1796	HOTC p147
James	CUMMIN		Kilkeel	a freehold farmer in 1785	HOTC p129
James	CUMMIN		Kilkeel	a member of the Mourne Volunteer Corps 4 Aug 1792	HOTC p127
James	CUMMIN		Kilkeel	a flax grower; granted a spinning wheel premium in 1796	HOTC p147
John	CUMMIN		Kilkeel	a flax grower; granted a spinning wheel premium in 1796	HOTC p147
William	CUMMIN	senior & jnr	Kilkeel	a flax grower; granted a spinning wheel premium in 1796	HOTC p147

# **Genetic Genealogy**

Much has been written about this subject, and it changes almost daily; it bears occasional repeating to keep our knowledge and understanding current. A good discussion appears on my favourite source, Wikipedia – <u>http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Genetic\_genealogy</u>

Here's a bit of the history copied from the site:

The investigation of surnames in genetics can be said to go back to George Darwin, a son of Charles Darwin. In 1875, George Darwin used surnames to estimate the frequency of first-cousin marriages and calculated the expected incidence of marriage between people of the same surname (isonymy). He arrived at a figure between 2.25% and 4.5% for cousin-marriage in the population of Great Britain, with the upper classes being on the high end and the general rural population on the low end. (His parents, Charles Darwin and Emma Wedgwood, were first cousins.) This simple study was innovative for its era. The next stimulus toward using genetics to study family history had to wait until the 1990s, when certain locations on the Y chromosome were identified as being useful for tracing male-to-male inheritance.

Dr. Karl Skorecki, a Canadian nephrologist of Ashkenazi parentage, noticed that a Sephardic fellowcongregant who was a Kohen like himself had completely different physical features. According to Jewish tradition, all Kohanim are descended from the priest Aaron, brother of Moses. Skorecki reasoned that if Kohanim were indeed the descendants of only one man, they should have a common set of genetic markers and should perhaps preserve some family resemblance to each other.

To test that hypothesis, he contacted Professor Michael Hammer of the University of Arizona, a researcher in molecular genetics and pioneer in Y chromosome research. Their report in the Nature in 1997 sent shock waves through the worlds of science and religion. A particular marker was indeed more likely to be present in Jewish men from the priestly tradition than in the general Jewish population. It was apparently true that a common descent had been strictly preserved for thousands of years. (See Y-chromosomal Aaron). Moreover, the data showed that there were very few "non-paternity events."

The first to test the new methodology in general surname research was Bryan Sykes, a molecular biologist at Oxford University. His study of the Sykes surname obtained valid results by looking at only four markers on the male chromosome. It pointed the way to genetics becoming a valuable assistant in the service of genealogy and history.

In April 2000, Family Tree DNA began offering the first genetic genealogy tests to the public. This offering marked the first time that a personal theory on the Y chromosome could be tested outside of an academic study. Additionally, Sykes' concept of a surname study, which by this time had been adopted by several other academic researchers outside of Oxford, was expanded into online Surname Projects (an early form of social network) and the effort helped spread knowledge gained through testing to interested genealogists worldwide.

In 2001, Sykes went on to write the popular book The Seven Daughters of Eve, which described the seven major haplogroups of European ancestors. In the wake of the book's success, and with the

growing availability and affordability of genealogical DNA testing, genetic genealogy as a field began growing rapidly. By 2003, the field of DNA testing of surnames was declared officially to have "arrived" in an article by Jobling and Tyler-Smith in Nature Reviews Genetics. The number of firms offering tests, and the number of consumers ordering them, had risen dramatically [estimated in 2006 to be a \$60 billion industry!].

**Sorenson Genomics**, the lab that does testing for Ancestry.com, has this information on the site Sorenson Molecular Genealogy Foundation <a href="http://www.smgf.org/pages/how\_it\_works.jspx">http://www.smgf.org/pages/how\_it\_works.jspx</a>):

DNA encodes the complete genetic blueprint of human beings. It's what makes the billions of people on the planet unique, yet at the same time, genetically similar to their parents and ancestors. DNA is found in most cells in the human body, and can be classified into three types that are useful in genealogy:

Y-Chromosome DNA (Y-DNA) Mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) Autosomal DNA

•••

Y-DNA is a type of DNA that is only carried by men, who inherit it from their fathers. This means that males with a common paternal ancestor have similar Y-DNA.

Y-DNA is particularly useful for tracing one's direct paternal line (father, paternal grandfather, etc.) because it changes slowly from generation to generation, and in most societies, the surname of the father is also inherited by his sons.

•••

mtDNA is a type of DNA carried by both males and females, but is only inherited from the mother. This makes mtDNA useful for tracing one's direct maternal line (mother, maternal grandmother, maternal great-grandmother, etc).

•••

Autosomal DNA is the type of DNA responsible for most physical characteristics, such as height, eye color, etc. Autosomal DNA is inherited by sons and daughters from both parents (and from all four grandparents, etc).

•••

A very active discussion site is this one on RootsWeb -- a good place to read and learn. http://archiver.rootsweb.ancestry.com/th/index/GENEALOGY-DNA/ We received some photos from Karen McKenzie (basowizza@googlemail.com), who wrote:



Happy New Year ! I am sending you two EDGAR family photos which I promised many moons ago. The family lived in Carnforth, Lancashire, England. The post-funeral pic is July 1934, from the grave of Mary Clement Edgar. The four-generation shot is somewhat later.

Enjoy, Karen [Edgar] Mackenzie

Four-generation pic, elderly chap in the middle is my great-grandfather, Joseph Thompson Edgar.

More of the Carnforth Edgars, pictured at Mary Clement Edgar's grave, July 1934.

From the left – son Frank, son-inlaw Ted Postlethwaite, son Bob, son Edward.

Middle – Joseph Thompson Edgar [then carrying on from JOSS as he was known]

William, son Isaac [my grandad], and son John.



# Ramblings

by Steve Edgar, Weston, Crewe (steven-edgar@sky.com)



I don't have a particular subject this month, so....

### Frequency of the name Edgar

In the English census, there are 50 records of Edgar families in 1841, 422 in 1851, 767 in 1861, 1335 in 1871, 1941 in 1881, 2406 in 1891, and 3042 in 1901. This massive increase was mostly due to immigrant Edgar families from Scotland and Ireland coming to England for work. The few families already in England were also adding to these numbers as they had children and grandchildren. Not all of these people actually stayed in England; some were transient. I have found census records where the stated place of birth for the children has been Ireland, then Scotland, and then England. In the next census they're all missing, so presumably the left for the New World.

#### Edgar Ministers

At the moment, we are working on tracing the Edgar Ministers family to try to get a couple of living members to do DNA tests. We need to do more than one test so that they both confirm each other. We will need to trace the lines of separate groups to do this. We have this line traced back to about 1640 in Scotland. This is the family that fought at the Battle of the Boyne in 1690 (this is the 4 Edgars and 1 McKee, or 4 McKees and 1 Edgar family. I'm still not convinced which version is true). The family we want details on are Robert McCheyne Edgar who married Marion Pollock. Children were Robert McCheyne Jr, Agnes, Ursula, Alexander Pollock, William Wylie, and Cyril.

If you have family links to the ministers, please let us know.

### McKees

Looking at the old McKee and Edgar records we know that there was at least 1 McKee and 1 Edgar who fought together and afterwards lived close to each other and intermarried. I'm not sure if they lived in Ireland before the battle or if they met *en route*, there are two versions of this. One is that they <u>returned</u> to their farms, the other states that they <u>claimed</u>



their farms. The McKees came from Penninghame in Scotland. James and I were there last September. One of my projects had been to find this place and look for farms/families. When we arrived, there was nothing but fields, a mile away there was a church with a graveyard that contained no Edgars or McKees. We travelled on into Newton Stewart and found Minnigaff Cemetery, which has lots of McKees. They even have their

own mausoleum and crypts!

Asking around in the town, there are loads of McKees still there, even down to the car

W6 KEE

number plates! Logically then, Newton Stewart and the surrounding area is home to the McKees. But, when we enquired about Edgars we drew a blank. Someone mentioned

a veterinarian who had lived close by, but no others. There were none buried in the graveyard either. It was looking like the Edgars and the McKees were not associated in this place prior to 1690; the "BOTB" (Battle of the Boyne) Edgars are from another location, probably in Dumfries and Galloway. Logically then, they should be **Haplogroup I2b1**, as are most of the other Edgars in that area. If this is the case, we can match them into other families, BUT I do suspect that they may be connected to my family, in which case they will be E1b1b.

#### **Real locations**

There are many Edgar families appearing in the north of Co. Armagh, close to the border of Co. Antrim and Co. Down. There are also records of Edgar families in Co. Antrim and Co. Down; it is only when you look at a map do you realize how close these places are to each other. They could well be separated only by a line on a map and be of the same family. It's funny how our mind categorizes people into boxes or locations. My New Year's Resolution is to ignore county boundaries and look at a map for the town or village where the record comes from. I suppose the answer is a large map on the wall with pins in it. Lisburn is an example of this; it is in Co. Antrim, but it's very close to Co. Down, and should be considered as a main commerce centre for north Down.

#### 1700s

Looking at the records we have, those from the 1700s are one hundred times more valuable than those from 1900. Any ancestors you have from the period 1600 - 1700 may well be shared by other Edgars within our group. This is the time when the early migration to the USA and Canada took place, leaving behind relatives in Ireland or Scotland. If you have an MRCA to anyone else of less than 25, and have a family record with a birth in the 1700s, it may well be that there is a match waiting for you. Please forward to James any details you have of early Edgars, things like parish records, land records, *etc*.

#### My database

This now contains 15,000 Edgar-related details and is producing matches for people who enquire. If you have a long-lost relation send me an email, <u>steven-edgar@sky.com</u> and I'll see if I can find a match.

#### Mailshots

We sometimes send out mailshots to anonymous Edgars to further our research. We provide a brief explanation as to the whos, whats, and whys, and links to our Web site <a href="http://jameswd.sasktelwebsite.net/james.htm#Edgar%20Events">http://jameswd.sasktelwebsite.net/james.htm#Edgar%20Events</a> These usually provide us with new contacts and answers to some questions and even DNA results. This is where you members come in. Can I ask a favour? Please look in your local phone book? Are there any Edgars? Are they known to you? If not, please will you write to them or phone them? We have 200 of you as members of the Edgar group, if you all sent 5 letters or made 5 phone calls that would be 1000 contacts. Results from this would provide a huge leap forward in our numbers and maybe get the missing bits from your own family.

#### Edgar Families and DNA

The more DNA results that come in continue to convince me that my thoughts on the various DNA groups are correct. The original family were R1b Celts, which fits in nicely with their

ancestor Crinan "The Thane of Dunkeld" in AD 1000. Given this early date, it would have enabled the Edgar family a chance to produce enough offspring to show MRCA counts on DNA.Ancestry.com beyond 39 generations, and are therefore not reliable enough to be counted.

These individual groups start to show as families later, but appear to be unrelated to each other. This family is now found mostly in Berwickshire, south of Edinburgh, and a few in the Angus area. What happened next was the I1 Viking was somehow introduced and became a separate line. This line also appears in Norway and Northern Europe.

This line is predominant in the Angus and Grampian areas of Scotland and is likely to be how the house at Keithock changed hands between Edgars (who thought themselves unrelated) from the original R1b to the I1, who are now heads of the Edgar Clan in Canada.

The I2b1 in Dumfries and Galloway are another offshoot of the Edgars and are really strong in the local area; whether they are an offshoot of R1b or I1 is not known either way. I have no leanings for either group.

My family group the E1b1b would logically be an offshoot from the I2b1 in Dumfries and Galloway, but this is also open for conjecture. If my ancestor had come from D&G, then it would be easy (see "McKees" above) but, as there is no evidence, they could have come from anywhere!

If your ancestors come from Glasgow, Edinburgh, Cumberland, Manchester, Newcastle, Yorkshire, Liverpool, or any industrial town in the United Kingdom, then, without a DNA test you cannot be sure which family group you belong to. During the Industrial Revolution from 1750 to 1850, families were drawn into these areas for work. Social and economic conditions were harsh, disease rampant, and many families were too concerned with survival to worry about origins or siblings who had migrated. I have attempted to record all the Edgar families in Salford and Manchester from the 1841 census up to the 1911 census. My results (so far) show in excess of 30 unrelated (as yet) Edgar families arriving in and leaving the area, some do not even appear on consecutive census records.

Ramblings over

Steve

## **Edgar DNA Trust Fund status**

We have once again nearly used up the Edgar DNA Trust Fund. Since my last appeal for donations, we have tested the following people: **William** of Edinburgh; **Colin** of Arbroath; **Bill** (The Pilot) of Dundee; **Dennis** of Aberdeen; **Chris** of Dundee; **Ray Croxford** of Cape Town; **Steven** of Gravois Mills, MO (these last three are paid for but not yet completed analysis). And, we have that outstanding test for **David** of Forfar now on its way to the lab.

<u>This is a request for more donations</u> – we need the funds to keep the drive going. We have had some great successes in recent weeks, and it is through generous donations from you, our readers, that we can continue with our quest. Please help, if you can – no amount is too small.

Send cheque or money order in US or Canadian dollars. I can also accept PayPal.

**David Edgar** of Guildford (yes, the same **David Edgar** on p. 4 above) has kindly supplied a pair of maps of Edinburgh, the first originally drawn by **William Edgar** in 1742; the second updated on orders of **William Maitland** and published in 1765. Enjoy!



EDGAR'S MAP, 1746

